

A Counterexample to Cover's $2P$ Conjecture on Gaussian Feedback Capacity

Young-Han Kim

February 7, 2008

Abstract

We provide a counterexample to Cover's conjecture that the feedback capacity C_{FB} of an additive Gaussian noise channel under power constraint P be no greater than the nonfeedback capacity C of the same channel under power constraint $2P$, i.e., $C_{\text{FB}}(P) \leq C(2P)$.

Index Terms—Additive Gaussian noise channels, channel capacity, conjecture, counterexample, feedback.

1 Background

Consider the additive Gaussian noise channel

$$Y_i = X_i + Z_i, \quad i = 1, 2, \dots,$$

where the additive Gaussian noise process $\{Z_i\}_{i=1}^{\infty}$ is stationary. It is well known that feedback does not increase the capacity by much. For example, the following relationships hold between the nonfeedback capacity $C(P)$ and feedback capacity $C_{\text{FB}}(P)$ under the average power constraint P :

$$\begin{aligned} C(P) &\leq C_{\text{FB}}(P) \leq 2C(P) \\ C(P) &\leq C_{\text{FB}}(P) \leq C(P) + \frac{1}{2}. \end{aligned}$$

(See Cover and Pombra [1] for rigorous definitions of feedback and nonfeedback capacities and proofs for the above upper bounds. Throughout this paper, the capacity is in bits and the logarithm is to base 2.)

These upper bounds on feedback capacity were later refined by Chen and Yanagi [2] as

$$\begin{aligned} C_{\text{FB}}(P) &\leq \left(1 + \frac{1}{\alpha}\right) C(\alpha P) \\ C_{\text{FB}}(P) &\leq C(\alpha P) + \frac{1}{2} \log \left(1 + \frac{1}{\alpha}\right) \end{aligned}$$

for any $\alpha > 0$. In particular, taking $\alpha = 2$, we get

$$C_{\text{FB}}(P) \leq \min \left\{ \left(\frac{3}{2}\right) C(2P), C(2P) + \frac{1}{2} \log \left(\frac{3}{2}\right) \right\}.$$

In fact, Cover [3] conjectured that

$$C_{\text{FB}}(P) \leq C(2P)$$

and it has been long believed that this conjecture is true. (See Chen and Yanagi [4, 5] for a partial confirmation of Cover's conjecture.)

2 A Counterexample

Consider the stationary Gaussian noise process $\{Z_i\}_{i=1}^\infty$ with power spectral density

$$S_Z(e^{i\theta}) = |1 + e^{i\theta}|^2 = 2(1 + \cos \theta). \quad (1)$$

Now under the power constraint $P = 2$, it can be easily shown [6, Section 7.4] that the nonfeedback capacity is achieved by the water-filling input spectrum $S_X(e^{i\theta}) = 2(1 - \cos \theta)$, which yields the output spectrum $S_Y(e^{i\theta}) \equiv 4$ and the capacity

$$C(2) = \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} \frac{1}{2} \log \left(\frac{S_Y(e^{i\theta})}{S_Z(e^{i\theta})} \right) \frac{d\theta}{2\pi} = 1 \text{ bit}.$$

On the other hand, it can be shown [7] that the celebrated Schalkwijk–Kailath coding scheme [8, 9] achieves the feedback rate $-\log x_0$, where x_0 is the unique positive root of the equation

$$Px^2 = (1 - x^2)(1 - x)^2 = (1 + x)(1 - x)^3. \quad (2)$$

under the power constraint P . (For the details on the performance analysis of the Schalkwijk–Kailath coding scheme for the given noise spectrum (1), refer to [10, Section 4].)

Now for $P = 1$, we can readily check that the unique positive root x_0 of (2) should be less than $1/2$, since $f(x) := x^2 - (1 + x)(1 - x)^3$ is strictly increasing and continuous on $[0, 1]$ with $f(0) = -1$ and $f(1/2) = 1/16$. Therefore,

$$C_{\text{FB}}(1) \geq -\log x_0 > 1 = C(2).$$

References

- [1] T. M. Cover and S. Pombra, “Gaussian feedback capacity,” *IEEE Trans. Inform. Theory*, vol. IT-35, no. 1, pp. 37–43, 1989.
- [2] H. W. Chen and K. Yanagi, “Refinements of the half-bit and factor-of-two bounds for capacity in Gaussian channel with feedback,” *IEEE Trans. Inform. Theory*, vol. IT-45, no. 1, pp. 319–325, 1999.
- [3] T. M. Cover, “Conjecture: Feedback doesn’t help much,” in *Open Problems in Communication and Computation*, T. M. Cover and B. Gopinath, Eds. New York: Springer-Verlag, 1987, pp. 70–71.
- [4] K. Yanagi, “On the cover’s conjecture of Gaussian feedback capacity,” in *Proc. IEEE International Symposium on Information Theory*, Ulm, Germany, 1997, p. 130.
- [5] H. W. Chen and K. Yanagi, “On the cover’s conjecture on capacity of Gaussian channel with feedback,” *IEICE Trans. Fundamentals*, vol. E80-A, no. 11, pp. 2272–2275, 1997.
- [6] R. E. Blahut, *Principles and Practice of Information Theory*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley, 1987.
- [7] S. Yang, A. Kavcic, and S. Tatikonda, “Linear Gaussian channels: feedback capacity under power constraints,” in *Proc. IEEE International Symposium on Information Theory*, Chicago, IL, June/July 2004, p. 72.
- [8] J. P. M. Schalkwijk and T. Kailath, “A coding scheme for additive noise channels with feedback. I. No bandwidth constraint,” *IEEE Trans. Information Theory*, vol. IT-12, pp. 172–182, April 1966.
- [9] J. P. M. Schalkwijk, “A coding scheme for additive noise channels with feedback. II. Band-limited signals,” *IEEE Trans. Information Theory*, vol. IT-12, pp. 183–189, April 1966.
- [10] Y.-H. Kim, “Feedback capacity of the first-order moving average gaussian channel,” November 2004, submitted to *IEEE Trans. Info. Theory*. [Online]. Available: <http://arxiv.org/abs/cs.IT/0411036>